

**Challenges for the public health policy  
by the European Union extension to the East**

View on Possible Future Development

**HealthRegio Conference  
27-28 February 2006**

**Dr. Edit Eke**

Dr. Miklós Szócska, Dr. Emília Gaál

**Semmelweis University  
Health Services Management Training Centre  
Budapest, Hungary**

# Introduction

- **Main theme of the presentation:**

- Brief presentation of an **ongoing migration research study** conducted by HSMTC and its **relevance to health policy** both at national and international level; with emphasis on **the importance** of the EU accession of Hungary.

- **Main aims of the presentation:**

- To highlight international; EU contexts of physicians' migration and the challenges it generates for **all** EU member states;
- To **initiate, provoke, continue** thinking & working together: **what aspects** must be considered, **what further steps** are recommended and needed, **what co-operations** could be started to handle migration relating issues appropriately.

# Outline of the presentation

- **Short introduction to** Hungarian Health care, HR issues of HC, EU accession and its relevant consequences (from our present viewpoint)
- **Semmelweis University Health Services Management Training Centre (HSMTC) Physicians' Migration Research Study**
  - Introduction
  - Results, evaluation, conclusions and considerations
  - Health Policy Considerations
- **Challenges for the EU** public health policy, possible future developments

# Background 1

- Hungarian Health Care System
- Situation regarding HC HR issues prior to and at time of the accession and the period since it, Stakeholders
- **EU accession: May 1, 2004**
- World-wide brain drain
- The Metrics of the Physician Brain Drain (Mullan, NEJM, October 27, 2005)

# Background 2

- Study relating basic information
  - Why?
  - When?
  - How?
  - Training system of Medical Doctors in Hungary
  - Definitions:
    - resident doctor (= residents, R), medical students, potential migrants (who intend to leave), definitive migrants (who already left, work abroad), [university applicants] (cannot be reached and thus surveyed in current prelim system),
    - General Medical Doctors: GMD (students and residents who study/graduate as GMDs),
    - Dentists: D (students and residents who study/graduate as Ds)

# Health Professionals' Migration Research Study 1;

HSMTTC, Budapest, Hungary

- **Objectives 1:**

- To ensure real, authentic data;
- To examine the intentions to work abroad among Hungarian health care professionals; comprehensively, in length of time;
- To explore the motivation patterns and dynamics in the background in details;
- To work up, analyse and evaluate data in contexts;
- To get valid picture about the current situation and trends;
- To consider possible health policy recommendations and implications;
- To use the data & results to support the development of appropriate health policy implications and decisions, both at national and international (EU) level;

# Health Professionals' Migration Research Study 2;

HSMTC, Budapest, Hungary

- **Objectives 2:**

- To integrate and complete the available, but fragmented information into one system;
- To develop a communicating network of the involved parties and stakeholders;
- To help and support professional strategy developments to prevent and/ or handle potential negative effects and deal with migration in a way that benefits most involved and affected parties;
- To ensure arguments to influence the priority structure of the Hungarian society (and EU Health Policy);
- To conclude what lessons should be learnt and used in future strategies;

# Health Professionals' Migration Research Study 3;

## HSMTC, Budapest, Hungary

- **Objectives 3:**
  - To join (initiate) national and international migration research studies in health care and relating fields;
  - To establish a national and international (Eastern- Central Europe) Migration Observatory;
  - To influence health policy at the European level (EU):
    - To talk about migration issues openly;
    - To realise, explore and analyse the problem and its consequences;
    - To develop strategies at European level to deal with it.

# Health Professionals' Migration Research Study 4;

HSMTC, Budapest, Hungary

- **Target groups:**
  - Medical doctors (Physicians' Migration Research Study), nurses, physiotherapists.
  - Several age groups, respectively:
    - students, freshly graduated professionals, specialized professionals, potential migrants, definitive migrants.
- **Methods:**
  - Questionnaire survey (adaptable to the different age groups; #Q: 18/ 32), structured interviews in case of the definitive migrants.
- **Partner organisations:**
  - Hungarian Association of Resident Doctors;
  - The Office of Authorisation and Administrative Procedures of the Ministry of Health;
  - Ministry of Health.

# Physicians' Migration Research Study;

HSMTC, Budapest, Hungary

- **Target groups** (four medical schools: Budapest and three big cities):
  - medical students on their 1st and 6th year (GMD, D),
  - residents (GMD, D),
  - specialised MDs,
  - potential migrants,
  - definitive migrants.
  - *(university applicants: pupils who apply for medical schools – they cannot be reached in current prelim system)*
- **The surveyed population so far:**
  - residents: 646 ; GMD: 547, D 99:
  - medical students: 582
    - 1st course: 306
    - 6th course: 274

# Number of questionnaires filled in

from the beginning of the study in 2004 until 08/ 02/ 2006

2004	Szeged	Budapest	Altogether
Residents (GMDs)	70	221	291
2005	Szeged	Budapest	Altogether
Residents (GMDs)	0	139	139
Residents (Ds)	0	66	66
6th year (GMDs)	60	157	217
1st year (GMDs)	147	159	306
2006	Szeged	Budapest	Altogether
Residents (GMDs)	0	117	117
Residents (Ds)	0	33	33
6th year (GMDs)	0	57	57
<b>Altogether; 08 / 02/ 2006</b>	<b>278</b>	<b>949</b>	<b>1226 (646 R)</b>

# Data from 2005;

Number of questionnaires filled in: 728

(We had survey in each age groups we survey currently.)

2005	Szeged	Budapest	Altogether	<b>Altogether, specified by age-groups</b>
Residents (GMDs)	0	139	139	<b>Residents: 205</b>
Residents (Ds)	0	66	66	
6th Course (GMDs)	60	157	217	<b>Students, 6th year: 217</b>
1st Course (GMDs)	147	159	306	<b>Students, 1st year: 306</b>
2005	207	521	728	<b>728</b>

# Main results

- Migration intentions I
- Evaluation of the situation and respect of the sector and profession II
- Motivation patterns III
  - Most frequent and relevant answers and choices;
  - According to age-groups;
  - Comparisons if it can be done and/or interesting to see.

# Main results I ; migration intention

- Residents - # 205
- Students, 6th year - # 217
- Students, 1st year - # 306
- Altogether - 728



# Main results I/1; migration intentions; Residents (# 205)

2005	Residents (GMDs) # 139 ( Budapest)	Residents (Ds) # 66 ( Budapest)
<b>Do You plan to work abroad?</b> <i>Proportion of the „YES” answer in percentages.</i>	<b>73%</b>	<b>49%</b>
<b>How strong is your intention to work abroad? (# /%)</b> <i>Please, note: group that answers „yes” to the previous question is taken as 100% !!!</i> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. I have got written contract with a HC institution abroad.</li> <li>2. I have verbal agreement with a HC institution abroad.</li> <li>3. I correspond and talk over the phone with several potential HC workplace abroad.</li> <li>4. I have not got any agreement and/or direct relation with any HC institutions yet, but I am surely looking for this option and will find one. I actively prepare to this option.</li> <li>5. I have had some enquires, but have not made any direct steps yet.</li> <li>6. I have this option is among my future plans.</li> </ol>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>One person</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Two persons</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>5%</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>22%</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>16%</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>55%</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>One person</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>0</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>0</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>12%</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>12%</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>70%</b></p>

# Main results I/ 2; migration intentions; Medical Students; 6th year ( #217)

<b>2005</b>	Medical Students, 6th year GMDs; # 217 (Budapest, Szeged)
<b>Do You plan to work abroad?</b> <i>Proportion of the „YES” answer in percentages.</i>	<b>73%</b>
<b>Why did you apply for medical university?</b> <i>Please, note: group that answers „yes” to the previous question is taken as 100% !!!</i>  <b>„I will obtain a diploma that can be used all over Europe.”</b>  (This is one possible answer. Each one should be weighed according to its importance in the decision. This is the proportion of respondents who consider it as a „very important factor” in their decision.)	<b>18%</b>
<b>How strong is your intention to work abroad after obtaining your diploma?</b> <b>„This is why I want to become a medical doctor.”</b>  (This is one possible answer out of five , one can be chosen.)	<b>One person</b>

# Main results I/ 3; migration intentions; Medical Students; 1st year ( #306)

<b>2005</b>	Medical Students, GMDs 1st year, # 159, Budapest	Medical Students, GMDs 1st year, # 147, Szeged
<b>Do You plan to work abroad?</b> <i>Proportion of the „YES” answers in percentages.</i>	69%	67%
<b>Why did you apply for medical university?</b> <b>„I will obtain a diploma that can be used all over Europe”</b> <i>Please, note: group that answers „yes” to the previous question is taken as 100% !!!</i> (This is one possible answer. Each one should be weighed according to its importance in the decision. This is the proportion of respondents who consider it as a „very important factor” in their decision.”)	14%	33%
<b>How strong is your intention to work abroad after obtaining your diploma?</b> <b>„This is why I want to become a medical doctor.”</b> (This is one possible answer out of five , one can be chosen.)	3%	5%

# Main results I/ 4; migration intentions;

Comparison: 1st year ( # 306) & 6th year ( # 217)

„How strong is your intention to work abroad after obtaining your diploma?“

2005	1st year ( # 306), GMDs Budapest #159    Szeged # 147		6th year ( # 217), GMDs (Budapest & Szeged)
This is why I want to become a medical doctor. I do not want to work at home. After obtaining medical diploma I have a carrier abroad in my view.	<b>3%</b>	<b>5%</b>	<b>One person (0.5%)</b>
I do prepare for this option, I do have a particular idea regarding this.	<b>10%</b>	<b>11%</b>	<b>16%</b>
I do prepare for this option, but I do not have a particular idea regarding this yet.	<b>11%</b>	<b>13%</b>	<b>19%</b>
I consider this option, bear it in mind and actively gather relating information.	<b>27%</b>	<b>16%</b>	<b>32%</b>
I consider this option, it is among my future plans, but I am not active yet.,	<b>50%</b>	<b>54%</b>	<b>32%</b>

# Main results II; Situation and respect of the sector and profession

- Residents - # 205
- Students, 6th year - # 217
- Students, 1st year - # 306
- Altogether - 728



# Main results II/ 1;

## Perception of situation and respect of the sector and profession; Medical Students; 1st & 6th year, GMDs

2005	1st year # 306	6th year # 217
<p>What do You think: <b>How the situation of medical doctors has changed</b> in Hungary in the past four years? <i>(There are 5 grades, the two most frequently chosen are presented.)</i></p>	<p><b>Worsening: 46%</b> <b>Stagnating: 36%</b></p>	<p><b>Worsening : 43%</b> <b>Stagnating : 45%</b></p>
<p>What do You think generally about the <b>situation of MDs in Hungary?</b> <i>(There are 5 grades, the two most frequently chosen are presented.)</i></p>	<p><b>Bad: 60%</b> <b>Very bad: 20%</b></p>	<p><b>Bad : 54%</b> <b>Very bad: : 22.5%</b></p>
<p>What do You think about the change of the <b>situation of HC in Hungary</b> in the past four years? <i>(There are 5 grades, the two most frequently chosen are presented.)</i></p>	<p><b>Worsening : 56% (SOTE)</b> <b>Stagnating : 28% (SOTE)</b></p>	<p><b>Worsening : 48%</b> <b>Stagnating : 36%</b></p>

# Main results 11/ 2;

## Perception of situation and respect of the sector and profession; Medical Students; 1st & 6th year; GMDs

2005	1st year # 306	6th year # 217
<p>How do you consider your <b>living standards</b> in another European Union country, compared to Hungary?</p> <p>(four options, the two most frequently chosen are presented)</p>	<p>Much better: 72%</p> <p>Better: 26%</p>	<p>Much better: 76%</p> <p>Better: 23%</p>
<p>How do you consider your <b>working circumstances</b> in another European Union country, compared to Hungary?</p> <p>(four options, the two most frequently chosen are presented)</p>	<p>Much better: 62% (Budapest)</p> <p>Better: 34% (Budapest)</p>	<p>Much better: 59%</p> <p>Better: 39%</p>

# Main results III; Motivation patterns

- Residents - # 205
- Students, 6th year - # 217
- Students, 1st year - # 306
- Altogether - 728



# Main results III; Motivation patterns

## What factors motivate You to work abroad?; Residents # 205

*There are several answers, each one is weighed according to its importance in the decision.*

*We list the ones that most GMD R respondents consider as „important” factor in order of frequency, compared to D R respondents’ answers.*

*Please, note: group that answers „yes” to the question: „Do You plan to work abroad?” is taken as 100% !!!*

<b>2005</b>	Residents (GMDs) <b># 139</b> ( Budapest)	Residents (Ds) <b># 66</b> ( Budapest)
Payment	81%	76%
Better living circumstances, living standard	80%	46%
Better working circumstances (infrastructure)	66%	42%
My savings abroad will ensure better social safety after returning	66%	52%
Learn, master a foreign language	64%	67%
Professional development and carrier options	53%	36%
Professional possibilities	56%	39%

# Important to emphasize

- The presented data are very precious, but cannot be taken as „hard” facts. They indicate an intention that **may or may not lead** to migration for a certain period of time or finally to an other country.
- There are **no** available, valid, reliable, official **data on definitive migration**.
- Registration, thus **follow up of parallel work and/or commuting** is not possible at present time.
- Information from **employment agencies** (specialized for HC) could add another, valuable piece to the picture, but **conflict of interests** makes it difficult.

# Additional important information 1

Official available data regarding „migration intention” of health professionals  
The Office of Authorisation and Administrative Procedures of the Ministry of Health

01/ 05/ 2004 - 31/ 12/ 2004

- **In the first year after the accession 906** medical doctors applied for certification; (504 „new”, 402 already worked abroad)
- 80% of all issued certificates were for MDs; 90%, if we take dentists into consideration as well;
- Age: 60% were between 24-39 years; Gender: 76% were males
- „Top” specialisations:
  - #1: anaesthesiologists;
  - #2: orthopaedics, family doctors;
  - #3: surgeons.

# Additional important information 2

Medical University Schools; applications, admissions and graduations; 1998-2005.

<b>year</b>	<i>Applications GMD</i>	<i>Admissions GMD</i>	<i>Graduated GMD</i>	<i>Applications D</i>	<i>Admissions Dentists</i>	<i>Graduated D</i>
<b>1998</b>	4414	749		1765	132	
<b>1999</b>	3994	741		1662	100	
<b>2000</b>	3475	744		1503	116	
<b>2001</b>	3472	715	1075	1245	132	117
<b>2002</b>	3348	738	1059	1280	124	72
<b>2003</b>	3553	741	907	1217	131	118
<b>2004</b>	5027	759		1351	132	
<b>2005</b>	6392	893		1898	176	

# Important to emphasize 2

- Inflow does exist as well and may be increasing,
  - Hungarian minority is the biggest minority in the Carpathian Basin,
  - Hungary is the East gate of the European Union,
  - Problem of training, knowledge and practise differences,
  - Language, communication and cultural issues.
- 
- Experiences from other „traditional” fields of brain-drain and world-wide research and policies on migration and brain-drain issues can be and should be used in strategy developments both at national and international level.
- 
- Information flow and analysis is basic and critical point.

# Conclusions and considerations 1

- Carrier development plan;
- Research and exploration of motivation patterns and their change in course of the training and work;
- Influence work-force market, explore its strategy, involving professional bodies;
- Strategic planning of human resources;
- Change of training system;
- ...

# Conclusions and considerations 2

- Research studies to examine and **explore international patterns**, aspects and contexts of health professionals' migration;
- Investigation of financial, economic issues at **international** level: a new field of brain-drain!;
- Professional options; integration of work & practise abroad into the training system; agreements at **international** level;
- Professional co-operations;
- Influence, ruling of the market at **international** level with bilateral and/ or multilateral agreements – employment agencies;
- Development of a strategy/ several strategies at **EU level** to handle consequences and find solution for economic issues;
- Documentation, registration - **harmonization**;
- Communication, co-operation; ...

# EHMA PROFMOBILITY Project

30 months, 20 associated partners, Hungary: Semmelweis University

- **Specific objectives:**

- „Mapping” of flows of Health Professionals within Europe & to & from non European countries;
- Outlining the international policy context of professional mobility;
- Assessing national level policy responses to HP mobility;
- Examining employers’ recruitment strategies;
- Examining impact on recruited staff;
- Assessing the impact on patients and health status.

# Thank You for Your Honouring Attention

